

Exhibit I

From: Boone, Brian
Sent: Thursday, February 22, 2024 7:08 AM
To: Paul Farrell Jr.
Cc: David R. Cohen (David@SpecialMaster.Law); Sage Vanden Heuvel; Peter Mougey; Page Poerschke; PBM@listserv.motleyrice.com; McGowan, Emily; Tara MacNeill; Harder, Bradley; Madison Shelquist; Springer, Brandon; Eric Lyttle; Chemerinsky, Kim; Jordan, Bill; Olga Vieira; ESI-Opioids; Hatchett, Andrew; Cooper, Jonathan
Subject: RE: MDL2804: PBM: Optum DR22 deficiency letter

Paul:

I sent a letter, not a "letter brief." And in the letter, I explained that if the PEC still has a DR-22 dispute with OptumRx after reading our letter, the parties can discuss a briefing schedule for any motion that the PEC intends to file. We will not agree to anything short of what the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure (Rule 37 included) require.

As for your other comments, all I can say is that we always stand ready to meet and confer in good faith over any discovery dispute, and I've found that talking through disputes instead of writing letters is more productive.

Brian D. Boone
ALSTON & BIRD
Vantage South End
1120 South Tryon Street
Suite 300
Charlotte, NC 28203-6818
+1 704 444 1106 (office)
+1 704 441 1959 (mobile)
brian.boone@alston.com

From: Paul Farrell Jr. <Paul@FarrellFuller.com>
Sent: Thursday, February 22, 2024 6:17 AM
To: Boone, Brian <Brian.Boone@alston.com>
Cc: David R. Cohen (David@SpecialMaster.Law) <david@specialmaster.law>; Sage Vanden Heuvel <sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com>; Peter Mougey <pmougey@levinlaw.com>; Page Poerschke <ppoerschke@levinlaw.com>; PBM@listserv.motleyrice.com; McGowan, Emily <Emily.McGowan@alston.com>; Tara MacNeill <taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com>; Harder, Bradley <Bradley.Harder@alston.com>; Madison Shelquist <mshelquist@levinlaw.com>; Springer, Brandon <Brandon.Springer@alston.com>; Eric Lyttle <ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com>; Chemerinsky, Kim <Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com>; Jordan, Bill <Bill.Jordan@alston.com>; Olga Vieira <olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com>; ESI-Opioids <esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com>; Hatchett, Andrew <Andrew.Hatchett@alston.com>; Cooper, Jonathan <jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com>
Subject: Re: MDL2804: PBM: Optum DR22 deficiency letter

EXTERNAL SENDER – Proceed with caution

Dear Mr. Boone,

You should send Special Master Cohen your letter brief. You accuse me of taking a frivolous position. I do not think that word means what you think it means. Nonetheless, your continued rhetoric is dangerous. The PEC declines to meet with you on further discovery disputes. We will confer only in writing moving forward. To be clear, the PEC will continue to abide by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the applicable Rules of Professional Responsibility. We will not abide manipulation of the spoken word nor cower to bully tactics.

I look forward to learning or teaching a lesson. This matter is ripe and we stand on our position paper previously submitted.

Paul T. Farrell, Jr., Esq.

Farrell & Fuller, LLC
270 Munoz Rivera Ave., Suite 201
San Juan, Puerto Rico 00918
phone: 304.654.8281
email: paul@farrellfuller.com

"Facts are stubborn things."

-John Adams
President of the United States.
Trial lawyer.

This communication is for use only by the intended recipient and may contain confidential, attorney-client privileged, and/or attorney-work product communications and information.

On Feb 21, 2024, at 11:03 PM, Boone, Brian <Brian.Boone@alston.com> wrote:



External
(brian.boone@alston.com)



GUA

Paul:

As you know, we sent a letter earlier this evening. We did not copy Special Master Cohen.

Brian D. Boone

ALSTON & BIRD
Vantage South End

1120 South Tryon Street

Suite 300

Charlotte, NC 28203-6818

+1 704 444 1106 (office)

+1 704 441 1959 (mobile)

brian.boone@alston.com

From: Paul Farrell Jr. <Paul@FarrellFuller.com>

Sent: Wednesday, February 21, 2024 7:41 PM

To: Boone, Brian <Brian.Boone@alston.com>; David R. Cohen (David@SpecialMaster.Law)

<david@specialmaster.law>; Sage Vanden Heuvel <sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com>

Cc: Peter Mougey <pmougey@levinlaw.com>; Page Poerschke <ppoerschke@levinlaw.com>;

PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM <PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM>; McGowan, Emily

<Emily.McGowan@alston.com>; Tara MacNeill <taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com>; Harder, Bradley

<Bradley.Harder@alston.com>; Madison Shelquist <mshelquist@levinlaw.com>; Springer, Brandon

<Brandon.Springer@alston.com>; Eric Lyttle <ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com>; Chemerinsky, Kim

<Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com>; Jordan, Bill <Bill.Jordan@alston.com>; Olga Vieira

<olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com>; ESI-Opioids <esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com>; Hatchett, Andrew

<Andrew.Hatchett@alston.com>; Cooper, Jonathan <jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com>

Subject: RE: MDL2804: PBM: Optum DR22 deficiency letter

EXTERNAL SENDER – Proceed with caution

You live in Charlotte.

Your probably sending this email from home.

The day is ended.

Paul T. Farrell, Jr., Esq.

Farrell & Fuller, LLC

270 Munoz Rivera Ave., Suite 201

San Juan, Puerto Rico 00918

phone: 304.654.8281

email: paul@farrellfuller.com<<mailto:paul@farrellfuller.com>>

"Facts are stubborn things."

-John Adams

President of the United States.

Trial lawyer.

This communication is for use only by the intended recipient and may contain confidential, attorney-client privileged, and/or attorney-work product communications and information.

From: Boone, Brian <Brian.Boone@alston.com>

Sent: Wednesday, February 21, 2024 7:37 PM

To: Paul Farrell Jr. <Paul@FarrellFuller.com>; David R. Cohen (<David@SpecialMaster.Law>

<david@specialmaster.law>; Sage Vanden Heuvel <sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com>

Cc: Peter Mougey <pmougey@levinlaw.com>; Page Poerschke <ppoerschke@levinlaw.com>;

PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM; McGowan, Emily <Emily.McGowan@alston.com>; Tara MacNeill

<taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com>; Harder, Bradley <Bradley.Harder@alston.com>; Madison Shelquist

<mshelquist@levinlaw.com>; Springer, Brandon <Brandon.Springer@alston.com>; Eric Lyttle

<ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com>; Chernerinsky, Kim <Kim.Chernerinsky@alston.com>; Jordan, Bill

<Bill.Jordan@alston.com>; Olga Vieira <olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com>; ESI-Opioids <[esi-](mailto:esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com)

opioids@quinnemanuel.com>; Hatchett, Andrew <Andrew.Hatchett@alston.com>; Cooper, Jonathan

<jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com>

Subject: Re: MDL2804: PBM: Optum DR22 deficiency letter

Paul: As I said in my email last week, we're sending you a letter before day's end. Brian D. Boone
ALSTON & BIRD Vantage South End 1120 South Tryon Street Suite 300 Charlotte, NC 28203-6818 +1 704
444

[[cid:image001.png@01DA64FD.D0600C70](#)]

External (brian.boone@alston.com<mailto:brian.boone@alston.com>)

[[cid:image002.png@01DA64FD.D0600C70](#)]

Paul:

As I said in my email last week, we're sending you a letter before day's end.

Brian D. Boone

ALSTON & BIRD

Vantage South End

1120 South Tryon Street

Suite 300

Charlotte, NC 28203-6818

+1 704 444 1106 (office)

+1 704 441 1959 (mobile)

brian.boone@alston.com<mailto:brian.boone@alston.com>

From: Paul Farrell Jr. <Paul@FarrellFuller.com<mailto:Paul@FarrellFuller.com>>

Sent: Wednesday, February 21, 2024 7:17:13 PM

To: Boone, Brian <Brian.Boone@alston.com<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com>>; David R. Cohen
(David@SpecialMaster.Law<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law>>)
<david@specialmaster.law<mailto:david@specialmaster.law>>; Sage Vanden Heuvel
<sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com>>

Cc: Peter Mougey <pmougey@levinlaw.com<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com>>; Page Poerschke
<ppoerschke@levinlaw.com<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com>>;
PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM>>; McGowan, Emily
<Emily.McGowan@alston.com<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com>>; Tara MacNeill
<taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com>>; Harder, Bradley
<Bradley.Harder@alston.com<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com>>; Madison Shelquist
<mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com>>; Springer, Brandon
<Brandon.Springer@alston.com<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com>>; Eric Lyttle
<ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com>>; Chemerinsky, Kim
<Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com>>; Jordan, Bill
<Bill.Jordan@alston.com<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com>>; Olga Vieira
<olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com>>; Jonathan Cooper
<jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com>>; ESI-Opioids
<esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com>>; Hatchett, Andrew
<Andrew.Hatchett@alston.com<mailto:Andrew.Hatchett@alston.com>>

Subject: RE: MDL2804: PBM: Optum DR22 deficiency letter

EXTERNAL SENDER – Proceed with caution

Special Master Cohen,

Having received no response from OptumRx, this matter is now ripe for your consideration.

Paul T. Farrell, Jr., Esq.

Farrell & Fuller, LLC

270 Munoz Rivera Ave., Suite 201

San Juan, Puerto Rico 00918

phone: 304.654.8281

email: paul@farrellfuller.com<mailto:paul@farrellfuller.com<mailto:paul@farrellfuller.com>>

“Facts are stubborn things.”

-John Adams

President of the United States.

Trial lawyer.

This communication is for use only by the intended recipient and may contain confidential, attorney-client privileged, and/or attorney-work product communications and information.

From: Boone, Brian <Brian.Boone@alston.com<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com>>

Sent: Wednesday, February 14, 2024 7:04 PM

To: Paul Farrell Jr. <Paul@FarrellFuller.com<mailto:Paul@FarrellFuller.com>>; David R. Cohen
(David@SpecialMaster.Law<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law>>); Sage Vanden Heuvel
<david@specialmaster.law<mailto:david@specialmaster.law>>; Sage Vanden Heuvel
<sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com>>

Cc: Peter Mougey <pmougey@levinlaw.com<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com>>; Page Poerschke
<ppoerschke@levinlaw.com<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com>>;
PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM>>; McGowan, Emily
<Emily.McGowan@alston.com<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com>>; Tara MacNeill
<taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com>>; Harder, Bradley
<Bradley.Harder@alston.com<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com>>; Madison Shelquist
<mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com>>; Springer, Brandon
<Brandon.Springer@alston.com<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com>>; Eric Lyttle
<ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com>>; Chemerinsky, Kim
<Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com>>; Jordan, Bill
<Bill.Jordan@alston.com<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com>>; Olga Vieira
<olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com>>; Jonathan Cooper
<jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com>>; ESI-Opioids
<esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com>>; Hatchett, Andrew
<Andrew.Hatchett@alston.com<mailto:Andrew.Hatchett@alston.com>>

Subject: RE: MDL2804: PBM: Optum DR22 deficiency letter

Paul: We will respond to this letter next Wednesday (February 21). I will be traveling Monday and Tuesday. Brian D. Boone ALSTON & BIRD Vantage South End 1120 South Tryon Street Suite 300 Charlotte, N

[\[cid:image007.png@01DA64FA.1E54DA90\]](#)

Caution: External

(brian.boone@alston.com<mailto:brian.boone@alston.com<mailto:brian.boone@alston.com>>)

First-Time Sender

[\[cid:image008.png@01DA64FA.1E54DA90\]](#)

Paul:

We will respond to this letter next Wednesday (February 21). I will be traveling Monday and Tuesday.

Brian D. Boone

ALSTON & BIRD

Vantage South End

1120 South Tryon Street

Suite 300

Charlotte, NC 28203-6818

+1 704 444 1106 (office)

+1 704 441 1959 (mobile)

brian.boone@alston.com<mailto:brian.boone@alston.com<mailto:brian.boone@alston.com>>>

From: Paul Farrell Jr.

<Paul@FarrellFuller.com<mailto:Paul@FarrellFuller.com<mailto:Paul@FarrellFuller.com>>>

Sent: Wednesday, February 14, 2024 9:05 AM

To: David R. Cohen

(David@SpecialMaster.Law<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law%3cmailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law>>>

<david@specialmaster.law<mailto:david@specialmaster.law<mailto:david@specialmaster.law>>>

<sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com>>>

Cc: Peter Mougey

<pmougey@levinlaw.com<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com>>>

<ppoerschke@levinlaw.com<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com>>>

PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM%3cmailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM>>>

>>> McGowan, Emily

<Emily.McGowan@alston.com<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com>>>; Tara MacNeill
<taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Boone, Brian
<Brian.Boone@alston.com<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com>>>;
Harder, Bradley
<Bradley.Harder@alston.com<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com>>>; Madison Shelquist
<mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com>>>;
Springer, Brandon
<Brandon.Springer@alston.com<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com>>>; Eric Lyttle
<ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Chemerinsky, Kim
<Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com>>>; Jordan, Bill
<Bill.Jordan@alston.com<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com>>>; Olga Vieira
<olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Jonathan Cooper
<jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com>>>; ESI-Opioids <esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com>>>

Subject: MDL2804: PBM: Optum DR22 deficiency letter

EXTERNAL SENDER – Proceed with caution

Dear OptumRx,

Attached please find a deficiency letter related to DR22. ESI should probably weigh in as well.

The parties have dug in pretty deep on this dispute already so not sure there is much left to discuss.

We have agreed to disagree.

We may want to proceed directly to briefing as ESI suggests below.

Doesn't make sense to me why you would want to proceed directly to motion practice on this, but lets discuss process on today's call.

Paul T. Farrell, Jr.

Farrell & Fuller, LC

270 Muñoz Rivera Ave., Suite 201

San Juan, PR 00918

Office: 939-293-8244

Cell: 304.654.8281

paul@farrellfuller.com<mailto:paul@farrellfuller.com<mailto:paul@farrellfuller.com>>

"Facts are stubborn things."

-John Adams

President of the United States.

Trial lawyer.

From: Paul Farrell Jr.

Sent: Wednesday, February 14, 2024 9:27 AM

To: 'David R. Cohen

(David@SpecialMaster.Law<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law%3cmailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law>>')'

<david@specialmaster.law<mailto:david@specialmaster.law<mailto:david@specialmaster.law>>>; Sage Vanden Heuvel

<sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com>>>

Cc: Peter Mougey

<pmougey@levinlaw.com<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com>>>; Page Poerschke

<ppoerschke@levinlaw.com<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com>>>; PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM%3cmailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM>>>; McGowan, Emily

<Emily.McGowan@alston.com<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com>>>; Tara MacNeill

<taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Boone, Brian

<Brian.Boone@alston.com<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com>>>;

Harder, Bradley

<Bradley.Harder@alston.com<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com>>>; Madison Shelquist
<mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com>>>;
Springer, Brandon
<Brandon.Springer@alston.com<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com>>>; Eric Lyttle
<ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Chemerinsky, Kim
<Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com>>>; Jordan, Bill
<Bill.Jordan@alston.com<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com>>>; Olga Vieira
<olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Jonathan Cooper
<jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com>>>; ESI-Opioids <esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com>>>

Subject: RE: Discovery Conferences

Dear ESI,

This process originates from the original Appointment Order (Doc. #69) (Filed: 01/11/18) which describes the duties of the special master to include: (1) meet separately and together with various groups to facilitate communications between and amongst (a) the parties, (b) any relevant outside entities, and (c) the Court; (2) assist the Court with mediating resolution of any part of the parties' disputes; (3) provide legal analysis of the parties' submissions; (4) ensure coordination with any related litigation or governmental action; (5) assist with preparation for attorney conferences (including formulating agendas), court scheduling, and case management; (6) interpret any agreements reached by the parties; and (7) direct, supervise, monitor, and report upon implementation and compliance with the Court's Orders. The Special Masters shall organize their activity to ensure non-duplication of effort and appropriate attention to the various groups of interested parties and counsel. A copy of the Appointment Order is attached for your reference.

The “informal process” is described as well: “If a Special Master issues an informal ruling or order that is not on the record (such as the resolution of a discovery dispute) either orally, via email, or through other writing, and a party wishes to object to that ruling or order, the party shall ask the Special Master to formalize the ruling or order by filing it on the docket or appearing before a court reporter. Such request shall be made within three days of issuance of the informal order or ruling, else the opportunity to object shall be waived. The procedures and deadlines outlined in this section shall then apply.” (p.5) (emphasis added for dramatic effect).

Paul T. Farrell, Jr.

Farrell & Fuller, LC

270 Muñoz Rivera Ave., Suite 201

San Juan, PR 00918

Office: 939-293-8244

Cell: 304.654.8281

paul@farrellfuller.com<mailto:paul@farrellfuller.com<mailto:paul@farrellfuller.com>>

“Facts are stubborn things.”

-John Adams

President of the United States.

Trial lawyer.

From: owner-pbm@listserv.motleyrice.com<mailto:owner-pbm@listserv.motleyrice.com<mailto:owner-pbm@listserv.motleyrice.com>> <owner-pbm@listserv.motleyrice.com<mailto:owner-pbm@listserv.motleyrice.com<mailto:owner-pbm@listserv.motleyrice.com>>> On Behalf Of David R. Cohen
(David@SpecialMaster.Law<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law%3cmailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law>>>)

Sent: Wednesday, February 14, 2024 7:54 AM

To: Sage Vanden Heuvel
<sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com>>>

Cc: Peter Mougey
<pmougey@levinlaw.com<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com>>>; Page Poerschke
<ppoerschke@levinlaw.com<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com>>>; PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM%3cmailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM>>>; McGowan, Emily
<Emily.McGowan@alston.com<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com>>>; Tara MacNeill
<taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Boone, Brian
<Brian.Boone@alston.com<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com>>>; Harder, Bradley
<Bradley.Harder@alston.com<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com>>>; Madison Shelquist
<mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com>>>; Springer, Brandon
<Brandon.Springer@alston.com<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com>>>; Eric Lyttle
<ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Chemerinsky, Kim
<Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com>>>

[.com](mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com)>>>; Jordan, Bill
<Bill.Jordan@alston.com<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com>>>; Olga Vieira
<olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Jonathan Cooper
<jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com>>>; ESI-Opioids <esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com>>>

Subject: Re: Discovery Conferences

Thank you for your suggestions. As for today, I look forward to "listening in" on your continued meet and confer during our telecon. I anticipate mostly listening, to begin gaining an unders

[\[cid:image009.png@01DA64FA.1E54DA90\]](#)

External

(david@specialmaster.law<mailto:david@specialmaster.law<mailto:david@specialmaster.law>>>)

[\[cid:image008.png@01DA64FA.1E54DA90\]](#)

Thank you for your suggestions. As for today, I look forward to "listening in" on your continued meet and confer during our telecon. I anticipate mostly listening, to begin gaining an understanding of the issues, and I may provide a light, mediating touch to help resolve disputes that you cannot bridge. I may also suggest the parties provide position statements via letter brief on issues where it is clear that agreement is not possible. We will see about the need for future meetings.

To repeat, I expect the parties to continue the meet-and-confer process during today's telecon, while I listen in. Like the PBMs, I am "hopeful that the parties can reach agreement on [many of] their disputes through a good faith meet and confer process." The extent to which we need any future meetings and motion practice will depend on your progress.

-d

=====

This email sent from:

David R. Cohen Co. LPA

24400 Chagrin Blvd., Suite 300

Cleveland, OH 44122

216-831-0001 tel

866-357-3535 fax

www.SpecialMaster.law<<http://www.SpecialMaster.law>><https://url.emailprotection.link/?bj-3WqUa7mf4idw8mjbv2KOihNDq3FPdnuuW7J-KwCi2V2UsbBMEj0yML_Se2w0dLmrDXEDhuEEHBseybpMT9mXQ~~~https://url.emailprotection.link/?bj-3WqUa7mf4idw8mjbv2KOihNDq3FPdnuuW7J-KwCi2V2UsbBMEj0yML_Se2w0dLmrDXEDhuEEHBseybpMT9mXQ~~~>>

From: Sage Vanden Heuvel
<sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com><<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com>>>>

Sent: Tuesday, February 13, 2024 9:10 PM

To: David R. Cohen
(David@SpecialMaster.Law<<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law><<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law%3cma>

<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law>>>)

<david@specialmaster.law<mailto:david@specialmaster.law<mailto:david@specialmaster.law>>>

Cc: Peter Mougey

<pmougey@levinlaw.com<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com>>>; Page
Poerschke

<ppoerschke@levinlaw.com<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com>>>;
PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.
MOTLEYRICE.COM%3cmmailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM>>

<PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.
MOTLEYRICE.COM%3cmmailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM>>>; McGowan, Emily

<Emily.McGowan@alston.com<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com>>>; Tara MacNeill

<taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Boone, Brian

<Brian.Boone@alston.com<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com>>>;

Harder, Bradley

<Bradley.Harder@alston.com<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com>>>; Madison Shelquist

<mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com>>>;

Springer, Brandon

<Brandon.Springer@alston.com<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com>>>; Eric Lyttle

<ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Chemerinsky, Kim

<Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com>>>; Jordan, Bill

<Bill.Jordan@alston.com<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com>>>; Olga Vieira

<olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com>>>; Jonathan Cooper

<jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com>>>; ESI-Opioids <esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:esi-
opioids@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com>>>

Subject: RE: Discovery Conferences

Dear Special Master Cohen,

Earlier this afternoon, the Plaintiffs and PBMs had their first meet-and-confer to discuss temporal and geographic scope objections. That meeting lasted approximately one hour, and during the conference the parties reached tentative agreement on several geographic scope issues.

Just a few hours ago, after the meet and confer, counsel for the Plaintiffs delivered their first response to Optum Rx's objections and discovery responses. A similar response was sent to Express Scripts on Friday, and the parties intend to meet and confer to discuss their positions. The PBMs are hopeful that the parties can reach agreement on their disputes through a good faith meet and confer process.

Nonetheless, Plaintiffs continue to press an informal process for bringing discovery issues to the Court. While we are willing to meet with the Court after a proper meet-and-confer and when issues are ripe for the Court's consideration, the PBMs object to informal discovery rulings. If counsel for the Plaintiffs believe that a discovery issue is ripe, they must bring a motion to compel, as Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 37 contemplates.

As to Plaintiffs' proposal for weekly meetings with the Court, the PBMs do not believe such a process would be practical or efficient. Among other issues, weekly conferences would discourage the parties from working things out on their own and meeting and conferring productively, instead relying upon the Court to settle each dispute.

Best,

Sage

Sage R. Vanden Heuvel

Of Counsel

Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP

865 S. Figueroa Street, 10th Floor

Los Angeles, CA 90017

213-443-3657 Direct

213-443-3000 Main Office Number

213-443-3100 Fax

sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com>>

www.quinnemanuel.com<<http://www.quinnemanuel.com>><https://url.emailprotection.link/?b-i4Y2Slj7mOBVEswst9wP6HZHa5YH_4nLH_Ww3VodlcGKOVog_pUowZWb0FuqF_-XuYrah62zyY5fglsrFtYA~~<https://url.emailprotection.link/?b-i4Y2Slj7mOBVEswst9wP6HZHa5YH_4nLH_Ww3VodlcGKOVog_pUowZWb0FuqF_-XuYrah62zyY5fglsrFtYA~~>>

NOTICE: The information contained in this e-mail message is intended only for the personal and confidential use of the recipient(s) named above. This message may be an attorney-client communication and/or work product and as such is privileged and confidential. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient or agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that you have received this document in error and that any review, dissemination, distribution, or copying of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by e-mail, and delete the original message.

From: Madison Shelquist

<mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com>>>

Sent: Tuesday, February 13, 2024 3:08 PM

To:

David@SpecialMaster.Law<<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law><<mailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law%3cmailto:David@SpecialMaster.Law>>>

Cc: Peter Mougey

<pmougey@levinlaw.com<<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com><<mailto:pmougey@levinlaw.com>>>>; Page Poerschke

<ppoerschke@levinlaw.com<<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com><<mailto:ppoerschke@levinlaw.com>>>>; PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM<<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM><<mailto:PBM@LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM>>>>; McGowan, Emily

<Emily.McGowan@alston.com<<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com><<mailto:Emily.McGowan@alston.com>>>>; Tara MacNeill

<taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com<<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com><<mailto:taramacneill@quinnemanuel.com>>>>; Sage Vanden Heuvel

<sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com<<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com><<mailto:sagevandenheuvel@quinnemanuel.com>>>>; Boone, Brian

<Brian.Boone@alston.com<<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com><<mailto:Brian.Boone@alston.com>>>>;

Harder, Bradley

<Bradley.Harder@alston.com<<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com><<mailto:Bradley.Harder@alston.com>>>>; Springer, Brandon

<Brandon.Springer@alston.com<<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com><<mailto:Brandon.Springer@alston.com>>>>; Eric Lyttle

<ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com<<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com><<mailto:ericlyttle@quinnemanuel.com>>>>; Chemerinsky, Kim

<Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com<<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com><<mailto:Kim.Chemerinsky@alston.com>>>>; Jordan, Bill

<Bill.Jordan@alston.com<<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com><<mailto:Bill.Jordan@alston.com>>>>; Olga Vieira

<olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com<<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com><<mailto:olgavieira@quinnemanuel.com>>>>; Jonathan Cooper

<jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com<<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com><<mailto:jonathancooper@quinnemanuel.com>>>>; ESI-Opioids <esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com<<mailto:esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com>>>>

<esi-opioids@quinnemanuel.com>>>

Subject: Discovery Conferences

[EXTERNAL EMAIL from

mshelquist@levinlaw.com<<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com><<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com>>>]

Special Master Cohen:

Please see the attached correspondence from Peter Mougey.

Thank you,

Madison Shelquist

Paralegal

Opioid Department

Levin, Papantonio, Rafferty, Proctor,

Buchanan, O'Brien, Barr & Mougey, P.A.

316 S. Baylen Street, Suite 600

Pensacola, FL 32502-5996

850.435.7127 (office)

850.436.6127 (fax)

mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com<mailto:mshelquist@levinlaw.com>>

[cid:image010.jpg@01DA64FA.1E54DA90]<<https://url.emailprotection.link/?bOEXVqQWPYGUWb2OYxf cGL5YJJPkYXeRvQ8KF PSIMqrL9vYa554JQTb3jvJ5sOEUPqrwSfoXg3caKL7e3 u88Q~<https://url.emailprotection.link/?bOEXVqQWPYGUWb2OYxf cGL5YJJPkYXeRvQ8KF PSIMqrL9vYa554JQTb3jvJ5sOEUPqrwSfoXg3caKL7e3 u88Q~>>>>>[cid:image011.jpg@01DA64FA.1E54DA90]<[https://url.emailprotection.link/?btIGrbuiMcSRUy-9IFiXOIlyfQUT7mkLQbuYon107buiQ90b6Y-H6BZNwQ58JHXIO3lxGbi3gGhV1clYEueRf98SBdd40pEdmgB1P9TaxnFPpe-aElQ4iXr-Hj8hRals8>>](https://url.emailprotection.link/?btIGrbuiMcSRUy-9IFiXOIlyfQUT7mkLQbuYon107buiQ90b6Y-H6BZNwQ58JHXIO3lxGbi3gGhV1clYEueRf98SBdd40pEdmgB1P9TaxnFPpe-aElQ4iXr-Hj8hRals8<https://url.emailprotection.link/?btIGrbuiMcSRUy-9IFiXOIlyfQUT7mkLQbuYon107buiQ90b6Y-H6BZNwQ58JHXIO3lxGbi3gGhV1clYEueRf98SBdd40pEdmgB1P9TaxnFPpe-aElQ4iXr-Hj8hRals8>>)>>[cid:image012.jpg@01DA64FA.1E54DA90]<<https://url.emailprotection.link/?bVO2q0UXR235wN yOnM0FjsmA05fzyuh154CUhTwqavNe 1ro2JYkMPjKPOLSc5d0hBH FxhQPW9Md9WPWg5YA~<https://url.emailprotection.link/?bVO2q0UXR235wN yOnM0FjsmA05fzyuh154CUhTwqavNe 1ro2JYkMPjKPOLSc5d0hBH FxhQPW9Md9WPWg5YA~>>>>>[cid:image013.jpg@01DA64FA.1E54DA90]<<https://url.emailprotection.link/?bo-uAEDwV-pcJZjW2AWiJYrqge1hhhPbxXXASCjyqqkzAQuTBs4AgurNRu9dY9oEp1MOQfW1sN9FOQfBPp0PXXKDvsO3BTh69GDcjLgYoo TFXE1kCXVCKFPXlaTGtD81v<https://url.emailprotection.link/?bo-uAEDwV-pcJZjW2AWiJYrqge1hhhPbxXXASCjyqqkzAQuTBs4AgurNRu9dY9oEp1MOQfW1sN9FOQfBPp0PXXKDvsO3BTh69GDcjLgYoo TFXE1kCXVCKFPXlaTGtD81v>>>>>

THE INFORMATION CONTAINED IN THIS TRANSMISSION IS PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION INTENDED ONLY FOR USE OF THE INDIVIDUAL OR ENTITY NAMED ABOVE. IF THE READER OF THIS MESSAGE IS NOT THE INTENDED RECIPIENT, YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED THAT ANY DISSEMINATION, DISTRIBUTION OR COPYING OF THIS COMMUNICATION IS STRICTLY PROHIBITED. IF YOU HAVE RECEIVED THIS TRANSMISSION IN ERROR, DO NOT READ IT. PLEASE IMMEDIATELY REPLY TO THE SENDER THAT YOU HAVE RECEIVED THIS COMMUNICATION IN ERROR. THEN DELETE IT. THANK YOU.

To unsubscribe from the PBM list, click the following link:

https://LISTSERV.MOTLEYRICE.COM/scripts/wa-MOTLEYRICE.exe?SUBED1=PBM&A=1<https://url.emailprotection.link/?b2u4L9dUTg_D3bxkEx_4Zu_y8x7SaGL7M4L0wa2W7TNOTcpBsAInlkhRzYhLGvBR4hrDJlxaw1GDKw1emAVkorGufvmo4iwLw1w3zOPSnkJTvsbf1G9yehuAXYys3y7MP><https://url.emailprotection.link/?b2u4L9dUTg_D3bxkEx_4Zu_y8x7SaGL7M4L0wa2W7TNOTcpBsAInlkhRzYhLGvBR4hrDJlxaw1GDKw1emAVkorGufvmo4iwLw1w3zOPSnkJTvsbf1G9yehuAXYys3y7MP>https://url.emailprotection.link/?b2u4L9dUTg_D3bxkEx_4Zu_y8x7SaGL7M4L0wa2W7TNOTcpBsAInlkhRzYhLGvBR4hrDJlxaw1GDKw1emAVkorGufvmo4iwLw1w3zOPSnkJTvsbf1G9yehuAXYys3y7MP>>

NOTICE: This e-mail message and all attachments may contain legally privileged and confidential information intended solely for the use of the addressee. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that you may not read, copy, distribute or otherwise use this message or its attachments. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender by email and delete all copies of the message immediately.